

Appendix D

Summary of Public Comments Received on the California Coastal Fishing Communities Meetings Staff Report

Compiled November 8, 2018; Revised July 2019

Following exploratory discussions with the California Fish and Game Commission (Commission) Marine Resources Committee (MRC) and the public in 2015 and 2016 regarding challenges and needs within California's coastal fishing communities, the Commission approved an MRC recommendation to broaden the conversation coastwide through a series of locally-focused coastal fishing community meetings along the California coast.

A total of seven locally-focused coastal fishing community meetings were held in 2017 and 2018 along the coast from Crescent City to San Diego, with participation from individual commissioners and staff. The meetings offered a venue to more thoroughly explore, from the perspective of specific fishing-dependent coastal communities, current conditions and changes being experienced in ports, constraints on adaptation, and needs for creating future resilience.

At the Jul 2018 MRC meeting, staff presented a staff report that summarized input from the various meetings to identify common themes, port-specific issues, and ideas to explore further. The staff report also identified a range of options for potential Commission focus and action in response to community concerns. Based on an MRC recommendation, the *Staff Report on California Coastal Fishing Communities Meetings* was opened for the public's feedback. The public comment period was open from July 17, 2018 through September 24, 2018. Fourteen public comment emails and letters were received from a variety of stakeholders, including commercial and recreational fishermen and fishing organizations.

The primary purpose of this document is to help inform MRC discussion and consideration of next steps at its July 2019 meeting. The document summarizes all public comments received during the public comment period (Table 1) and how staff treated the comment in the draft revised staff report.

In the summary of comments, the California Department of Fish and Wildlife is identified as "Department" for brevity.

Table 1. Public comments received on Staff Report on California Coastal Fishing Communities Meetings during the public comment period

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
1a	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	General Comment	<i>General comment:</i> Offered definition of a new term: "Perverse Wanton Waste", which he associates with lack of access to harvest available fishery resources due to legislative processes and bias against particular user groups, as has occurred with commercial abalone divers and constraints under Marine Mammal Protection Act.	Comment noted. Fish and Game Commission Code prohibits waste. Marine mammals are managed by federal regulations under the Marine Mammal Protection Act and are outside of state jurisdiction.	No change made
1b	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	General Comment	<i>Support:</i> Meetings were well-conceived, conducted, and timely. Staff were generous and respectful with speakers.	Support noted.	No change made
1c	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	General Comment	<i>General comment:</i> The staff report has many gaps relative to what was shared at meetings, and this is perceived to be a result of political motivation.	Staff report provides a summary of key themes and ideas provided at fishing communities meetings and is not intended to be a broader listing of all individual comments. However, individual meeting summaries have been added as Appendix C.	Individual coastal meeting summaries have been added as Appendix C.
1d	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	General Comment	Highlighted impact of marine protected areas, and challenged that they would fail without clean water, good human use resource	Marine mammals are managed by federal regulations under the Marine Mammal Protection Act and are outside of state jurisdiction. However, the staff	No change made

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				management, and minimal marine mammals.	report highlights stakeholder concerns associated with marine protected areas and marine mammal interactions with fisheries.	
1e	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	Meeting Highlights	Provided detailed overview of concerns with recreational red abalone fishery and loss of the commercial abalone fishery and the consequences to fishermen and the resource.	Potential material for a broader report. The report acknowledges concerns expressed by former commercial abalone fishermen about lingering socioeconomic impacts of the closures. The commercial and recreational abalone fisheries were closed as a result of population concerns. DFW is undertaking the development of an FMP that will explore the various issues and options for the take of a sustainable recreational abalone fishery	Potential material for future consideration.
1f	9/23/2018	Steven Rebuck, commercial and recreational fisherman	Meeting Highlights	Concerned about lack of emphasis on the issue of helping fishermen coexist with marine mammals; requests Commission to assist fishermen with addressing marine mammal encounters.	Clarified specific concerns within revised staff report. Marine mammal management is under federal jurisdiction. However, this concern has been noted in Appendix A.	No change made
2	7/30/2018	Don Thompson, Former commercial	Appendix A	<i>Request:</i> Wishes the appendix would include all original comments.	Meeting summaries from each coastal meeting were added to revision Appendices.	Appendices revised to include meeting summaries from

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
		abalone fisherman				each coastal meeting.
3	7/31/2018	William Diller	Appendix B	Provided concerns about inaccuracies on a chart included in the report	Redacted due to inaccuracies	Redacted due to inaccuracies.
4	7/31/2018	Tom Mattusch Commercial passenger fishing vessel operator	Appendix B	<i>Request:</i> Noted that the number of processors for specific ports were missing; requests to add to all snapshots.	Staff supports this comment; Port profiles are being developed by partners.	Potential material for future consideration.
5a	8/1/2018	Ken and Linda Bates, Commercial fisherman	General Comment	<i>Support:</i> Report is an accurate description of comments, trends, and fishermen's concerns over the decline and erosion of fishing, port infrastructure, and the culture of commercial fishing in California.	Support noted	No change made
5b	8/1/2018	Ken and Linda Bates, Commercial fisherman	General Comment	Commission staff accurately distilled a wide range of comment and concerns into concise points capable of assisting the Commission, Department, and California State Legislature in making substantial, timely changes in our fisheries policy; recommend that the Commission apply the information to change policy:	Support noted. MRC is continuing discussions to inform future management discussions with regard to fishing communities.	No change made

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
5c	8/1/2018	Ken and Linda Bates, Commercial fisherman	Staff Recommendations (SRs)	Supports all staff recommendations.	Support noted	No change made
5d	8/1/2018	Ken and Linda Bates, Commercial fisherman	SR 3 and SR 6	Recommendation/Request: Provided encouragement for the Commission and Department to moved forward with their proposal for innovative "experiments which even if they might fail, will provide data, experience and wisdom to manage California's fishery resource" (Marine Life Management Act) (i.e., north coast small boat squid access). Expresses that action should be taken swiftly.	Support noted.	No change made
6a	8/1/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, Alliance of Communities for Sustainable Fisheries (ACSF)	General Comment	Several ACSF board members attended the coastal meetings.	Comment noted.	No change made
6b	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	General Comment	<i>Recommendation:</i> Add recognition of loss of fishing infrastructure, especially loss of fish buyers and processors in California. A state policy that addresses restoring, encouraging, and	Added as Unique Challenge. Also addressed in Future Vision. Outside the scope of the FGC – perhaps a good focus for partner efforts?	Added as Unique Challenge. Also addressed in Future Vision.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				facilitating larger-scale buyer/processors is needed if fishing is to survive in communities.		
6c	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	General Comment	Development of state policy should address "access" issues around state and federal spatial closures such as marine protected areas, rockfish conservation areas.	TBD: Management actions referenced are in summary; included in revision Access issues around spatial closures are mentioned a lot. It should be included in the unique challenges, even if that doesn't translate. It is hinted at in the "Loss of Historic Fisheries" section, but more detail could be added.	Report revised (Unique Challenges, page 4) for greater emphasis on access challenges.
6d	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	General Comment	Concern about references to underserved "small" operators. In California, all fisheries are "small" in that there are no large factory-type trawler/processors or factory boats. California fisheries often have multi-generational fishing families with family "corporations" that are community bedrocks.	Included in revision.	Language used in Unique Challenges, page 4, modified.
6e	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SRs	Add recommendation to develop port-area "community sustainability plans" (CSPs). CSPs are	Included in revision. New recommendation added: #9.	Included in revised report as a new recommendation – SR 9.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				very useful provided other agencies (cities, port or harbor districts) commit to implementing the plan. A statewide CSP could be done but focus on what the State will do. This could be built into the fishing community policy.		
6f	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 1	Define "fishing community", or "fishing dependent community" as in the Magnuson-Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act.	Included in revision. Will be included in recommendation #1.	Included in revised report as part of staff recommendation 9.
6g	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 1	Expand on language from the California Coastal Act (sections 30703 and 30234) regarding the importance of commercial and recreational fishing space in harbors and protecting and upgrading harbor support for fishing and boating industries.	Outside the authority of the FGC; however the Commission conveyed these priorities to the California Coastal Commission as part of the Coastal Fishing Communities initiative.	No change made
6h	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 1	Suggests ACSF mission as a model - to connect fishermen with their communities (including the harbor authorities). Include directive to enhance these connections in the policy.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
6i	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 1	Include as State policy the goal of decreasing imported seafood by 25% over 10 years.	Outside the scope of the FGC authority.	No change made
6j	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 2	Critically important not to undermine or harm existing restricted access programs in your interest to provide access and opportunities for younger and "artisanal" fishermen. Restricted access programs create fishery stability and investment.	Concern noted in revised report.	Report revised to include this concern in Unique Challenges on page 4.
6k	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 4	Engage legislative staff and consultants to greatly improve their knowledge and understanding. Misinformation has led to legislation that has severely impacted fishing jobs directly and fishing infrastructure indirectly.	Included in revised report.	Included in revised report in staff recommendation 4
6l	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 5	Emphasize Department engagement in Pacific Fishery Management Council meetings as independent and science-based voices; recommend California policy require consideration of fishing communities, as in the Magnuson-Stevens Fishery	Included in revised report.	Included in revised report in SR 5

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				Conservation and Management Act.		
6m	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 6	Look to the City of Monterey and Monterey Fisheries Trust as a model and expand to State-managed fisheries. Statewide application would require changes to some rules regarding permit ownership, transferability, and leasing, to benefit both fishermen and communities. Look to both stabilize regional fisheries and create new opportunities.	Monterey Fisheries Trust added to revised report, statewide application is material for a broader report.	Included in revised report in SR 6
6n	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 3 and SR 6	Suggests ACSF mission as a model - to connect fishermen with their communities (including the harbor authorities). Include directive to enhance these connections in the policy.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
6o	9/20/2018	Kathy Fosmark & Frank Emerson, ACSF	SR 7	Engage fishermen in the science, including setting study design criteria; they have on-the-water expertise and observations to contribute.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
7	9/20/2018	Josh Churchman, Commercial Fisherman	General Comment	Expressed concern that many small ports may be left with no access to their local fishing grounds; there may be a migration of permits to areas where quotas are highest	Included in revision. Added to unique challenges (question 1)	Included in revised report as a unique challenge.
8a	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, California Wetfish Producer's Association (CWPA)	Unique Challenges (Question 1)	Objects to perceived inaccuracies and criticism of restricted access policy	Concern noted. Revised report reflects a more nuanced understanding of the topic reflecting both sides of the argument.	More in-depth consideration of issue included in revised report.
8b	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	Unique Challenges (Question 1)	It is important to recognize that many California fishermen are actually "small-scale" in the context of large national corporate fishing operations.	Included in revision.	More in-depth consideration of issue included in revised report.
8c	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	Unique Challenges (Question 1)	Expressed that the wetfish industry is in jeopardy of collapse if future Commission (and Council) actions undermine the stability that the restricted access policy has fostered.	Comment provides potential material for broader report; Restricted access policy analysis is underway with partners	Potential material for future consideration.
8d	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	General Comment	Suggests that the Commission operate under the principle that any response to climate change (or community resilience) must not undermine the goals and objectives	Concern noted in revised report.	Included in revised report in discussion of restricted access.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				inherent in existing limited entry programs.		
8e	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	Unique Challenges (Question 1)	Highlights the lack of flexibility under the current management structure in regard to adapting to environmental anomalies and challenges.	Concern noted in revised report	Included in revised report.
8f	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	Future Vision (Question 3)	Suggested that the concept of community-supported foundations, such as the Monterey Bay Fisheries Trust, could serve as local permit "banks" where permits could be purchased by the foundation and leased out, either in whole or in part.	Included in revision. Added to future vision. Community permit banks are part of SR 6.	Included in revised report in SR 6.
8g	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	General Comment	Reviewed and concur with most of the recommendations submitted by West Coast Fisheries Consultants and the Alliance of Communities for Sustainable Fisheries.	Support noted.	No change made
8h	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 1	Policy should begin by defining 'fishing community'; policy should incorporate language from the California Coastal Act that supports and protects	Included in revision. Added to SR 1.	Included in revised report in SR 1.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				fishing communities in adopting Commission policy;		
8i	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 1	The Commission should support a policy that encourages and incentivizes reducing the carbon footprint in fisheries.	Added to future vision in revised report	Included in revised report in future vision.
8j	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 2	Reiterates the importance ACSF comments on how it is critically important to not undermine or harm the existing limited entry system. Urges Commission to remember initial goals of RA policy.	Concern noted in revised report.	Included in revised report in discussion of restricted access.
8k	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 5	States that this recommendation is critically important when considering the potential northward shift of fishery stocks, so that these stocks can be fished	Support noted.	No change made
8l	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 6	Support this approach as a potential avenue to enhance flexibility and fishing opportunity in the face of climate change, both for established fishermen and potential new entrants.	Support noted.	No change made

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
8m	9/21/2018	Diane Pleschner-Steele, CWPA	SR 7	Strongly supports this approach, which CWPA demonstrated in its industry-sponsored squid research program.	Support noted.	No change made
9a	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, West Coast Fisheries Consultants (WCFC)	General Comment	Need to define "fishing community". This is not defined in Fish and Game Code, Title 14 of the California Code of Regulations, or the Marine Life Management Act. This is a top priority. Provides a recommended definition with two parts included.	Include in revision as part of SR 1	Included in revised report in SR 1.
9b	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Clarify what are the Commissions powers and limitations. We need to know this if we are to achieve the stated goal of the meetings, to identify "...areas in which the Commission can play a role to foster greater stability and long-term viability."	Included briefly in the revision (Background and opening paragraph)	Included in revised report in background section.
9c	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Recognize the provisions of the Public Resources Code (PRC, sections 30234 and 30703) which speak to importance, and priority, of commercial fishing and recreational boating industries in harbors.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
9d	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Improve description of the importance of infrastructure to the fishing industry. Providing access alone will not be adequate for smaller ports, unless ports and harbors commit to supporting infrastructure.	Included in revision	Included in revised report.
9e	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Recommends that the Commission consult with local port and harbor commissions to build an inventory of fishing infrastructure and facilities. Provides a suggested outline.	Seeking project funding. Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9f	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Staff report represents a solid foundation upon which to build a policy to protect and revitalize California's fishing communities. Suggests forming a blue-ribbon panel (WCFC cross-references PCFFA letter).	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9g	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	General Comment	Staff report may want to consider how CSPs could be used at a statewide, regional, or port-specific level.	Included in revision.	Included in revised report.
9h	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Background	Does not agree with how the background is characterized. Provided	Comment noted.	No change made

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				clarifications from commenter's perspective.		
	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights	Provided several specific comments pertaining to each of the key themes identified and discussed under: "1. Unique Challenges" (4 pages); "2. Current Adaptation Strategies"; "3. Future Vision"; and "4. Potential FGC actions".	Responses to individual comments noted below.	Responses to individual comments noted below.
9i	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights – Unique Challenges	Clarifies that the main complaint of limited access was MPAs	Included in revision	Included in revised report under unique challenges.
9j	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Consider efficiency when thinking about fleet and vessel size	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9k	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Add “increasing populations of protected species” to paragraph about changing conditions.	Marine mammals are outside scope of FGC; however, this concern has been noted in Appendix A.	No change made
9l	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Acknowledge that extreme events have differing impacts on different fisheries and a one-size-fits-all approach may not be useful	Added to revision	Included in revised report.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
9m	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Discuss alternate marketing arrangements under the Flexibility bullet point. Recommends easing red tape such as standardizing health department requirements.	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Health department code falls outside FGC	Potential material for future consideration.
9n	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Points out the inequality in the ability of small fishers to advocate in comparison with eNGOs.	Included in revision	Included in revised report.
9o	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	"Deteriorating Infrastructure" paragraph is too simplistic. Desires a detailed inventory of port facilities.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9p	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	"Retaining local markets" too simplistic. Provides a rewritten paragraph.	Included. Added to revision.	Included in revised report.
9q	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Recommends an audit for Title 14 to eliminate expired or unnecessary regulations and simplify where possible.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9r	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Points out "Permit Availability and Costs" paragraph may not be true for all limited entry fisheries.	Included. Added to revision.	Included in revised report.
9s	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Suggests numerous language changes to "Recruitment of young fishers" paragraph.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
9t	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Suggests substantial language changes to “Data gaps” bullet point.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9u	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Suggest adding to the “Competing uses” bullet point the Coastal Act’s prioritization of commercial fishing.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9v	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Unique Challenges	Suggests that Coastal Commission should meet with FGC whenever a port project directly impacts fishing facilities.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9w	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Potential Commission Actions	Note that SB 518 would have accomplished bullet point six, but was placed in inactive file.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9x	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Potential Commission Actions	Disagrees with recommendation to assess all fished stocks, especially market squid given short life expectancy.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9y	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	Meeting Highlights - Potential Commission Actions	Points out that artificial reefs could displace trawl fisheries.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9z	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SRs	Volunteers to offer additional input on implication of the recommendations.	Comment noted. Offer may provide potential material for broader report.	No change made

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
9aa	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 1	Define "fishing community", beginning with a review of federal regulations implementing National Standard 8.	Revision recommends creating a definition.	Included in revised report under staff recommendation #1 (SR 1).
9ab	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 2	Notes that some of the potential revisions could be legislative in nature.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9ac	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 3	Suggests language.	Language incorporated	Included in revised report.
9ad	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 4	Concurs that legislation could be necessary but be careful to avoid unintended consequences.	Comment noted	No change made
9ae	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 5	Agrees with recommendation, but suggests definitively adding any sister agencies. Specifically lists State Lands Commission, local port/harbor districts, and Bureau of Ocean Energy Management.	Support noted. Potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9af	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 6	Fully supports idea. Provides specific examples for how community banks could be utilized in California spiny lobster, and for permitted market squid vessels and brail vessels.	Support noted. Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
9ag	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 7	Agrees with recommendation. Look to the federal exempted fishing permit given to CWPA as a model of collaboration.	Support noted.. Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
9ah	9/24/2018	Mike Conroy, WCFC	SR 8	Extend survey to ports and harbors.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
10	9/24/2018	Peter Halmay, Commercial fisherman	General Comment	Recommended that resource users can self-organize to maintain resources rather than having governments impose solutions. Suggests support for Port based fishing organizations to develop rules and norms to guide fishers in decision making.	Staff recommendations 6 and 9 (SR 6 and SR 9) provide for such opportunities.	Staff Recommendation 9 (SR 9) added.
11	9/24/2018	Art Seavey, Monterey Abalone Company	General Comment	Requests that the Commission provide leadership to the Department and the state in order to invigorate responsible stewardship of the appropriate resources for aquaculture in our state.	Aquaculture issues of this nature are outside of the scope of this project; however, an Aquaculture BMP is in development.	No change made
12a	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, Pacific Coast Federation of Fishermen's Associations	General Comment	Encourages designing projects and policies that establish trust and enfranchise commercial harvesters in management processes. Fishers ought to	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
		(PCFFA); and Kimberly Selkoe and Chris Voss, Commercial Fishermen of Santa Barbara (CFSB)		have a stronger role in management and agencies should be trained and enabled to engage with fishers. Specifically requests collaborative partnerships between managers and fishermen and strategies to align economic incentives with quality management and monitoring, which can be supported by revisions to policy frameworks.		
12b	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe and Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	California must take proactive and innovative measures to manage for socioeconomic and ecological resilience in fisheries. Agencies must take steps to bring fishermen and managers into alignment on how measures are designed and implemented.	Comment provides potential material for broader report..	Potential material for future consideration.
12c	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	Suggests including an additional goals and objectives for managing marine resources in order to support fishing communities section in the revised report and aligning final	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				recommendations with the goals and objectives.		
12d	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	Provided 14 recommendations that build on the draft content of the staff report.	Many of these suggestions are for adding additional content. Given the scope of this report, all suggestions might better fit a broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12e	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should include a review of the current mandates dealing specifically with fishing communities found within the Fish and Game Code and/or driven by the state's coordination with federal management processes under the Magnuson-Stevens Act.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12f	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should specifically reference and reflect the provisions reviewed based on our recommendation (1) and specifically, the MLMA's various mandated for supporting fishing community needs.	Included in revision	Included in revised report.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
12g	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should include a section on the public trust, including a discussion of the Commission's various mandates to preserve access and enhance beneficial uses, as well as discuss how these relate to fishing community needs identified in the fishing community meetings and elsewhere.	Elements included in revision; longer discussion would better fit in a broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12h	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should focus on innovative approaches to data and collaboration with members of the fishing industry. The time is now to deploy an arsenal of ecosystem and fisheries indicators built on fishing behavior and fisheries-dependent data. Engaging fishermen in fisheries-dependent research while refraining from prescriptive and costly monitoring mandates whenever possible aligns fishermen with managers, facilitating trust and partnership. Let's invest in pushing digital data collection systems by the Department and	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Engaging fishers in data collection is addressed in "Unique Challenges" and in "Future Vision"	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				smartphone platforms for engaging fishermen in monitoring on the water.		
12i	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should focus on recommending new approaches to enhanced local co-management, which are urgently needed as fish stocks shift their locations with warming sea temperatures. Importantly, however, a management regime focused on increased flexibility also comes with pitfalls. Stock assessments and fishery management plans must be designed to enable flexibility during and between cycles. In addition, Experimental Fishing Permits should become a standard part of the management repertoire, and the Commission should familiarize itself with them and become comfortable adjudicating their use.	Reference to experimental fishing permits added to revision, longer discussion would be better served in a broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12j	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should include recommendations for the review of the Commission's and Department's budget processes with respect to supporting fishing	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				communities, including a review of the funding for mandates listed based on our recommendation (1). The report should include specific recommendations for how the Commission could best approach the forthcoming service-based audit of the CDFW in order to improve its mission and better meet the goals and objectives of the report based on our recommendation (3).		
12k	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should specifically address anadromous fisheries and the ways that the Commission can support communities that rely on them. The Commission's regulatory authority includes approaches to supporting the integrity of public trust anadromous fisheries for the benefit of fishing.	Outside of the scope of this project, potentially material for a broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12l	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 1	Any new Fishing Community policy framework should be founded on and explicitly enumerate the reinforcing pathways between the	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				biological sustainability of fisheries and the economic sustainability of fisheries. Further, Fish and Game Code needs fleshing out on the mechanisms for the Department to prioritize minimizing adverse impacts to fishing communities, responding quickly to environmental and socio-economic factors harming fishing as a livelihood, and communicating with fisheries stakeholders.		
12m	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The number and quality of tools available to managers is a limiting factor in being able to respond adaptively to environmental change, especially in ways that are protective of the economic stability and success of fishing. Permit stacking (e.g., the Bristol Bay gill net sockeye fishery is a great example of how a fishery can adaptively expand and contract with the resource with a mechanism that is economically rational.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
12n	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	Challenges to access and changes to access are the prime message of the report. We urge the Commission to make limited entry reform a priority. A blue-ribbon panel, which is representative of stakeholder and chaired by 1- 2 commission members, could be tasked with producing a set of detailed, well-researched recommendations on how to align the limited entry policy.	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Review of FGC's restricted access commercial fisheries policy aff recommendation.	Potential material for future consideration.
12o	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should make specific recommendations for the support of redeveloping and maintaining port infrastructure. We incorporate by reference comments provided by the Alliance of Communities for Sustainable Fisheries and MR. Mike Conroy, regarding infrastructure support, particularly the suggestion of the State-level adoption of the MSA's Community Sustainability Plan program, which provides a framework	Material for broader report. Port infrastructure is outside of the scope of the FGC.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				for implementing an analysis of community needs in a structures and uniform basis.		
12p	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	Market access and market dynamics must be considered in assessing the impact and effectiveness of new management actions. To do so, fishermen should be engaged as co-designers of new permits to make them economically feasible.	Included as future vision. Involving fishermen as designers of policy is mentioned in staff recommendation 3 (SR 3).	Included in revised report.
12q	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	General Comment	The report should encourage the development of innovative solutions to mitigate risk in commercial fisheries in the face of climate change and uncertainty. Financial tools to mitigate risk can add to the strategies for rapid recoveries from fisheries disasters.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12r	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Coastal Fishing Community Meeting Highlights	The synopsis of answers to the 4 core questions gathered at the meetings is a highly valuable product, and as such, we feel that the descriptions of topics under the Questions 2 and 3 could be fleshed out.	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Beyond current staff capacity.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
12s	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Coastal Fishing Community Meeting Highlights	In Question 2, more detail on the context in which these 4 adaptation strategies played out is important to document. Can you provide any insight into which of challenges listed in Question 1 (or something else) were mentioned as the likely triggers and causes of these adaptations? Did you hear perspectives on how well each of the adaptation strategies worked? Whether they had lasting positive or negative impacts on the nature of commercial fishing operations in the ports? Where these changes mostly permanent or temporary? Also lacking from the list is the frequent scenario in which fishermen must turn to public or family assistance because they do not find ways to implement these adaptation strategies. This is important to document here. The fisheries closures that led to Federal Disaster Assistance provide examples of this	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Beyond current staff capacity.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				that are well documented in State senate hearings, etc.		
12t	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Coastal Fishing Community Meeting Highlights	The descriptions of topics under question 3 are sometimes unclear and should be explored and developed more completely. What does “streamlined” refer to? Could an example or two be given? Why should “marine protected are collaboratives” be embraced, and what value do they provide to efforts to support communities? What does “electronic representations” mean? “Modernization of facilities is vague. Each of these bullet points deserves at least 2 -3 sentences of description, context and use of examples where possible.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12u	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Coastal Fishing Community Meeting Highlights	Permit transferability, a critically important issue area for this report with a vast amount of complexity, is repeatedly mentioned in the report with little background or context. The report would benefit from and introduction to the topic	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				within the “synopsis of perspectives”. This is an important component of access that isn’t mentioned in the section on “fisheries management changes and access”.		
12v	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Recommendations	The Recommendations section begins by pointing out that each suggested action gathered and listed in the report could be labeled as “management”, “policy”, or “other”. Perhaps this could be actually done in the report? It would add clarity, inform expectations, and help focus the conversation moving forward.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12w	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Recommendations	Add definition, statements of reason and justification to staff recommendations.	Included in revision.	Included in revised report.
12x	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 1	The 1 st priority listed needs a bit more clarity, given it’s top position. What is meant by this and what role it would play? For instance “this policy would be a vehicle for addressing x, y,	Comment provides potential material for broader report. Some detail was added to revision, but further analysis is material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
				and z..." or "this policy would fill a gap that exists..." How might this policy might be generated? Are there examples elsewhere to draw from and/or ideas of what it might include?		
12y	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 2	The 2 nd recommendation could be strengthened by focusing on generating changes to the policy in response to a review of the past performance of the policy.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12z	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 3	The 3 rd recommendation begs for an example. Please define what "small-scale fishing opportunities" refers to or is defined as, and explain what is meant by "information gaps".	Some detail was added to revision, but further analysis is material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12aa	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 4	The 4 th recommendation is somewhat obvious and vague. Can you explain how this should be done differently than how it is already being done?	Some detail was added to revision, but further description is potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12ab	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe,	SR 5	The 5 th recommendation also needs sharpening and focus. There is one prior suggestion in the report that CDFW engage more with	Some detail was added to revision, but further analysis is potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
		Chris Voss, CFSB		PFMC, but there is no context as to why and how? We assume that there is good justification for this, but without explaining the justification, it is difficult to motivate follow through and guide it to be done effectively. Please replace “etc” with named entities. To recommend that CDFW just engage “with everyone more” is not effective advice.		
12ac	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 6	The 6 th recommendation is concrete and specific – a good example to borrow from in how to improve the other recommendations.	Support noted.	No change made
12ad	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	SR 7	The 7 th – did the set of community meetings provide and starting list of specific data gaps and examples of collaborative research to build on? This should be included in appendix.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
12ae	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe,	SR 8	The 8 th – can you describe this in more detail so it doesn’t appear to be asking for the same process to be repeated? Perhaps the	Some detail was added to revision, but further analysis is material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
		Chris Voss, CFSB		report could include a section on information that was sought through the process, but was not well acquired. Describe which topics were difficult to inform through stakeholder engagement, and which have been well informed.		
12af	9/24/2018	Noah Oppenheim, PCFFA; and Kimberly Selkoe, Chris Voss, CFSB	Appendix	In appendix A, please use full sentences in order to communicate these ideas clearly, and leave less chance of misinterpretation.	Beyond current staff capacity.	No change made
13a	9/24/2018	Peter H. Flournoy, International Law Office of San Diego	General Comment	Expressed a concern for a lack of personnel and monetary resources. Changes will not be accomplished unless there is more money, time, and energy invested into coastal fishing communities.	Comment noted. Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
13b	9/24/2018	Peter H. Flournoy, International Law Office of San Diego	Appendix B	Requests for more analysis and comparison of charts for ports..	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
13c	9/24/2018	Peter H. Flournoy, International Law	General Comment	Encourages the development of fish markets along California's coast so local fishermen and their	Included in revision	Included in revised report.

Comment Number	Comment Date	Name and Affiliation	Section of Report or General Comment	Summary of Comment	Staff Response	Revisions Integrated into Staff Report
		Office of San Diego		communities could be supported.		
13d	9/24/2018	Peter H. Flournoy, International Law Office of San Diego	General Comment	Argues that the Commission and the Department do not have the resources to develop fisheries management plans for new species in a timely manner.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
13e	9/24/2018	Peter H. Flournoy, International Law Office of San Diego	General Comment	That state needs to invest in its fisheries to develop them.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.
13f	9/25/2018	Tom Peters, north coast community member	General Comment	Expressed the need for improved port infrastructure.	Comment provides potential material for broader report.	Potential material for future consideration.