

Draft Individual Review Form

Proposal number: 2001-F205-1

Short Proposal Title: Brake Pad Partnership

The agency I work for regulates one of the members of the Brake Pad Partnership. This is the closest connection, which I presume is none. The results of this project, if successful, would have an impact on our permitting decisions.

1a) Are the objectives and hypotheses clearly stated?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

The procedural objectives are clearly stated, i.e. to use a stakeholder process to develop and implement a wear debris test to determine the impact of copper from brake pads on water quality. However, the technical objectives are necessarily vague, since it is the function of the stakeholder process to develop the specific technical objectives.

1b1) Does the conceptual model clearly explain the underlying basis for the proposed work?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

As with question 1a, the procedural aspects of the proposal are clearly explained. However, the technical aspects to answer the basic question of the impact of brake pad copper are left up to the process to develop in the future.

1b2) Is the approach well designed and appropriate for meeting the objectives of the project?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

There are ultimate and intermediate goals of this project. The approach proposal, which is well designed and appropriate, deals with the intermediate goals of a stakeholder process to develop the appropriate approach to the ultimate objective. The approach to addressing the ultimate goal of the project is unknown at this time.

1c1) Has the applicant justified the selection of research, pilot or demonstration project, or a full-scale implementation project?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

Given the unknowns surrounding the issue of copper from brake pads and its environmental fate and impacts, the selection of a research project is justified.

1c2) Is the project likely to generate information that can be used to inform future decision making?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

If the stakeholder process successfully designs and implements a brake pad wear debris test, then the information generated would be useful for determining the source of copper in water ways.

2a) Are the monitoring and information assessment plans adequate to assess the outcome of the project?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

Monitoring of the stakeholder process portion of the proposal is adequate. Without the details of the wear debris test which the process proposes to design, it is not possible to assess whether it would be adequate.

2b) Are data collection, data management, data analysis, and reporting plans well-described, scientifically sound and adequate to meet the proposed objectives?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

Same comments as for question 2a.

3) Is the proposed work likely to be technically feasible?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

Given the participants in the stakeholder process, if there is agreement on an appropriate test, the results of that test should be technically feasible.

4) Is the proposed project team qualified to efficiently and effectively implement the proposed project?

Provide detailed comments in support of your conclusion [Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

The stakeholders in the collaborative process (industry, regulatory agencies, environmental groups, academic representatives) are representative of all interested parties in this issue and appear to have the technical expertise to accomplish the project.

Miscellaneous comments

[Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

**Overall Evaluation
Summary Rating**

- Excellent
- x Very Good
- Good
- Fair
- Poor

Provide a brief explanation of your summary rating

[Note: in the electronic version, this will be an expandable field]

Based on past experience of this collaborative stakeholder process, I would expect a successful outcome of its proposal to develop a brake pad wear debris test, including appropriate information on the environmental fate of copper from brake pads. Also, these stakeholder processes are in general useful when dealing with complicated environmental problems. However, without the particulars of the test design it is impossible to judge now how potentially effective the test itself would be.
