



**MARINE LIFE PROTECTION ACT
NORTH COAST STUDY REGION
DRAFT EIR**

CALIFORNIA FISH AND GAME COMMISSION
CALIFORNIA DEPARTMENT OF FISH AND GAME



March 2012

Marine Life Protection Act North Coast Study Region Draft Environmental Impact Report

Prepared for:

California Fish and Game Commission
1416 Ninth Street, Suite 1320
Sacramento, CA 95814
and
California Department of Fish and Game
1812 Ninth Street
Sacramento, CA 95811

Prepared by:

Horizon Water and Environment
1330 Broadway, Suite 424
Oakland, CA 94612

March 2012

Cover by Jennifer Natali Design. 2011. JenniferNatali.com

Photo of Mrs. Harry Roberts courtesy of the Roberts Collection, Humboldt State University Library. Image of Giant Kelp courtesy of NOAA Photo Library.

Horizon Water and Environment. *Marine Life Protection Act—North Coast Study Region Draft Environmental Impact Report*. 2012 (March). HWE 11.002. Oakland, CA.

CONTENTS

Executive Summary	ES-1
Introduction.....	ES-1
Proposed Project Overview	ES-1
Public Involvement Process.....	ES-7
Areas of Known Controversy.....	ES-8
Key Issues and Significant Impacts.....	ES-8
Alternatives Considered	ES-9
Chapter 1. Introduction.....	1-1
1.1 Background.....	1-1
1.2 Overview of CEQA Requirements.....	1-26
1.3 Scope and Intent of this Document.....	1-26
1.4 Topics Dismissed from Detailed Analysis	1-27
1.5 Consumptive Uses and Associated Socioeconomic Considerations	1-30
1.6 CEQA and Rulemaking Process.....	1-31
1.7 Organization of this EIR	1-33
1.8 Submittal of Comments.....	1-36
Chapter 2. Project Description.....	2-1
2.1 Project Location.....	2-1
2.2 Project Goals and Regional Objectives	2-3
2.3 Proposed Project	2-6
2.4 Proposed Project Alternatives.....	2-36
2.5 Management, Enforcement, and Monitoring of MPAs.....	2-43
Chapter 3. Physical Resources	3-1
3.1 Agricultural Resources.....	3.1-1
3.2 Air Quality.....	3.2-1
3.3 Global Climate Change and Greenhouse Gas Emissions	3.3-1
3.4 Water Quality	3.4-1
Chapter 4. Biological Resources.....	4-1
4.1 Introduction.....	4-1
4.2 Regulatory Setting	4-1
4.3 Environmental Setting.....	4-14
4.4 Impact Analysis.....	4-53
Chapter 5. Cultural Resources	5-1
5.1 Introduction.....	5-1
5.2 Regulatory Setting	5-2
5.3 Environmental Setting.....	5-7
5.4 Impact Analysis.....	5-18

Chapter 6. Social Resources..... 6-1

6.1 Land Use and Utilities 6.1-1

6.2 Public Services and Law Enforcement 6.2-1

6.3 Recreation 6.3-1

6.4 Research and Education 6.4-1

6.5 Vessel Traffic and Hazards..... 6.5-1

6.6 Environmental Justice 6.6-1

Chapter 7. Other Statutory Considerations..... 7-1

7.1 Introduction..... 7-1

7.2 Irreversible Impacts 7-1

7.3 Significant and Unavoidable Impacts 7-2

7.4 Growth Inducement 7-2

7.5 Cumulative Impacts..... 7-2

7.6 Mandatory Findings of Significance 7-12

Chapter 8. Alternatives Analysis..... 8-1

8.1 Introduction..... 8-1

8.2 Alternatives Screening Process 8-2

8.3 Alternatives Considered 8-5

8.4 Alternatives Considered and Dismissed from Detailed Analysis..... 8-20

8.5 Environmentally Superior Alternative 8-21

Chapter 9. Report Preparation 9-1

9.1 Lead Agency..... 9-1

9.2 Responsible Agency..... 9-1

9.3 EIR Authors 9-1

Chapter 10. References Cited 10-1

List of Appendices

- Appendix A.** Scoping Report
- Appendix B.** Characterization of Consumptive Uses and Associated Socioeconomic Considerations in the Region
- Appendix C.** North Coast Study Region Habitat and Species Atlas
- Appendix D.** List of Species Likely to Benefit from MPAs in the North Coast Study Region
- Appendix E.** Cultural Resources Analysis Memorandum: North Coast Study Region
- Appendix F.** Supplemental Information Provided by the Yurok Tribe of the Yurok Reservation

List of Tables

Table 1-1.	MPA Definitions, Restrictions, and Allowable Uses.....	1-4
Table 1-2.	Level of Protection and Associated Activities.....	1-9
Table 1-3.	Hazardous Waste and Substantes Sites in the Study Region	1-28
Table 2-1.	Proposed Regulation for Additions to General Provisions of Section 632, and for Marine Protected Areas, Marine Managed Areas, and Special Closures in the North Coast Study Region, including Proposed Regulations and Science Advisory Team- (SAT-) Assigned Level of Protection.....	2-17
Table 2-2.	Overall Summary of Proposed MPAs by Type and Size	2-33
Table 2-3.	Levels of Protection Provided by Proposed Project	2-33
Table 2-4.	Size of Individual MPAs in the Proposed Project.....	2-34
Table 2-5.	Habitat Representation in Proposed Project.....	2-35
Table 2-6.	Overall Summary for Alternative 1 (Existing MPAs)	2-36
Table 2-7.	Levels of Protection Provided by Alternative 1 (Existing MPAs)	2-36
Table 2-8.	Size of Individual MPAs in Alternative 1 (Existing MPAs)	2-37
Table 2-9.	Habitat Representation in Alternative 1 (Existing MPAs).....	2-37
Table 2-10.	Regulations for Alternative 1 (Existing MPAs).....	2-38
Table 2-11.	Overall Summary for Alternative 2 (ECA Proposal)	2-40
Table 2-12.	Levels of Protection Provided by Alternative 2 (ECA Proposal).....	2-40
Table 2-13.	Size of Individual MPAs in Alternative 2 (ECA Proposal)	2-41
Table 2-14.	Habitat Representation in Alternative 2 (ECA Proposal)	2-42
Table 3.2-1.	State and Federal Ambient Air Quality Standards.....	3.2-2
Table 3.2-2.	North Coast Air Basin Attainment Status of the State and Federal Ambient Air Quality Standards	3.2-7
Table 3.2-3.	Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions Factors.....	3.2-10
Table 3.2-4.	BAAQMD CEQA Thresholds of Significance for Criteria Air Pollutants	3.2-11
Table 3.2-5.	Average Daily Criteria Air Pollutant Emissions from Commercial Vessel Displacement	3.2-13
Table 3.2-6.	Maximum Annual Air Pollutant Emissions from Commercial Vessel Displacement	3.2-13
Table 3.3-1.	Greenhouse Gas Emissions Factors	3.3-7
Table 3.3-2.	Applicable BAAQMD CEQA Thresholds of Significance for Greenhouse Gases.....	3.3-8
Table 3.3-3.	Average Daily and Maximum Yearly CO ₂ e Emissions from Commercial Vessel Displacement	3.3-9
Table 3.4-1.	Areas of Special Biological Significance in the North Coast Study Region.....	3.4-6
Table 3.4-2.	Pollutant Point Sources in the North Coast Study Region	3.4-9
Table 3.4-3.	Impaired Water Bodies Discharging to the North Coast Study Region	3.4-12
Table 3.4-4.	Critical Coastal Areas in the North Coast Study Region.....	3.4-14
Table 4-1.	Special-Status Species Likely to Occur in the North Coast Study Region	4-3
Table 4-2.	Key Habitat Types in the North Coast Study Region.....	4-15
Table 4-3.	Depth Zones Identified by the SAT	4-16
Table 4-4.	Depth Zones as Percent of the North Coast Study Region	4-17
Table 4-5.	Summary of the Amount of Shoreline Habitats in the North Coast Study Region	4-18
Table 4-6.	Kelp Canopy Coverage in the North Coast Study Region.....	4-30

Table 4-7.	Approximate Amount of Hard- and Soft-Bottom Habitats by Depth Zone Area.....	4-31
Table 4-8.	Important Cetacean Species in the North Coast Study Region	4-38
Table 4-9.	Habitats and Species in the Proposed Project	4-62
Table 4-10.	Proposed MPAs which Overlap with Existing Regulations and Plans Protecting Biological Resources in the North Coast Study Region	4-68
Table 5-1.	Proposed MPAs and Special Closures, and Known Shipwreck Sites.....	5-14
Table 6.1-1.	Existing Land Uses Inside and Adjacent to Proposed Marine Protected Areas, Proposed Options, and Special Closures	6.1-8
Table 6.1-2.	Population by MLPA Region.....	6.1-11
Table 6.1-3.	Point Source Discharge Sites in the North Coast Study Region	6.1-13
Table 6.1-4.	Available Kelp Harvest Leases and Overlapping Proposed Project MPAs	6.1-19
Table 6.2-1.	Natural Resource Enforcement Agencies in California.....	6.2-3
Table 6.2-2.	U.S. Coast Guard Stations in the North Coast Study Region	6.2-5
Table 6.3-1.	Attendance at Coastal State Parks in the North Coast Study Region	6.3-3
Table 6.3-2.	Department of Parks and Recreation Revenue from Coastal State Parks in the North Coast Study Region.....	6.3-4
Table 6.3-3.	Facilities at Coastal Beaches in the North Coast Study Region, by County	6.3-5
Table 6.3-4.	Lighthouses in the North Coast Study Region	6.3-7
Table 6.3-5.	Recreational Sites Within and Adjacent to Marine Protected Areas in the North Coast Study Area	6.3-7
Table 6.3-6.	Tidepooling Sites in the North Coast Study Region	6.3-11
Table 6.3-7.	Public Ports and Marinas	6.3-12
Table 6.3-8.	Public Boat Launch or Hoist Locations.....	6.3-12
Table 6.3-9.	Activities Using Private and Rental Boats from Primary Public Launch Ramps in the North Coast Study Region, 2007	6.3-13
Table 6.3-10.	Registered Vessels in the North Coast Study Area, 1991 and 2008	6.3-14
Table 6.3-11.	Popular Kayak Routes in the North Coast Study Region.....	6.3-14
Table 6.3-12.	Popular Scuba Diving Sites in the North Coast Study Region	6.3-15
Table 6.3-13.	Popular Surfing Locations in the North Coast Study Region	6.3-16
Table 6.4-1.	Number of Scientific Collecting Permits Issued Statewide, 2002–2011.....	6.4-9
Table 6.5-1.	Registered Vessels in 1991 and 2008	6.5-7
Table 6.5-2.	Activities Using Private and Rental Boats from Public Launch Ramps, 2007 ...	6.5-10
Table 6.5-3.	Estimated Annual Recreational Angler Boat Trips in North Coast Marine Waters for CPFVs and Private Boats from 2005-2008.....	6.5-11
Table 6.6-1.	Population, Population Change, and Density in the North Coast Study Region	6.6-4
Table 6.6-2.	Population Percentages by Race or Ethnicity in the North Coast Study Region	6.6-5
Table 6.6-3.	Income and Poverty Rates by County, Major Cities, and State	6.6-6
Table 6.6-4.	Public Meetings, Workshops, Tribal Outreach Meetings, and Trainings Sponsored During the MLPA Planning Process.....	6.6-8
Table 6.6-5.	Proposed Marine Protected Areas and Shore Fishing Restrictions	6.6-14
Table 7-1.	Summary of Related Projects and Regulations.....	7-4
Table 7-2.	Summary of Cumulative Significant Impacts and Proposed Project’s Contribution.....	7-10
Table 8-1.	Summary of MPAs and Managed Areas by Type, Area, and Percentage of the North Coast Study Region for Existing, Proposed, and Alternative MPAs.....	8-5

Table 8-2. Size of Individual MPAs under Existing, Proposed, and Alternative Conditions 8-6

Table 8-3. Alternatives Comparison Table 8-7

Table 8-4. Regulations for Alternative 2 8-23

List of Figures

Figure ES-1. Proposed Project ES-3

Figure 1-1. Project Location and Existing Conditions 1-15

Figure 1-2. Legal Jurisdictions Offshore California 1-19

Figure 2-1. Proposed Project Map 2-9

Figure 2-2a. Individual MPAs in the Proposed Project 2-11

Figure 2-2b. Individual MPAs in the Proposed Project 2-13

Figure 2-2c. Individual MPAs in the Proposed Project 2-15

Figure 3.1-1. Humboldt Bay Water Use Designations 3.1-5

Figure 6.3-1. Total Travel Spending, by County, 2000–2009 6.3-10

Figure 6.5-1. Numbers of Commercial Fishermen and Vessels for Del Norte County, 1999–2008 6.5-8

Figure 6.5-2. Numbers of Commercial Fishermen and Vessels for Humboldt County, 1999–2008 6.5-8

Figure 6.5-3. Numbers of Commercial Fishermen and Vessels for Mendocino County, 1999–2008 6.5-9

Figure 8-1. Proposed Project Alternative 2 8-11

Figure 8-2a. Proposed MPAs in Alternative 2 8-13

Figure 8-2b. Proposed MPAs in Alternative 2 8-15

Figure 8-2c. Proposed MPAs in Alternative 2 8-17

ACRONYMS

°C	degrees Celsius
°F	degrees Fahrenheit
1-R	If R is the fraction of total area prohibited by MPAs within the North Coast Study Region, fishing vessel activity outside the MPAs would increase by a factor 1/
AB	Assembly Bill
AIS	aquatic invasive species
AQMD	Air Quality Management District
ARMP	Abalone Recovery and Management Plan
ASBS	Areas of Special Biological Significance
AWAF	Abandoned Watercraft Abatement Fund Grant Program
BAAQMD	Bay Area Air Quality Management District
Basin Plans	water quality control plans
bioregion	biogeographically relevant subregion
BLM	U.S. Bureau of Land Management
BMPs	best management practices
BRTF	Blue Ribbon Task Force
CAA	Clean Air Act
CAAQS	California Ambient Air Quality Standards
Cal-EPA	California Environmental Protection Agency
California Ocean Plan	Water Quality Control Plan for Ocean Waters of California
California Senate Bill 2040	Lempert-Keene-Seastrand Oil Spill Prevention and Response Act
Caltrans	California Department of Transportation
CARB	California Air Resource Board
CAS	2009 California Climate Adaptation Strategy
CCA	critical coastal area
CCC	California Coastal Commission
CCC	California Coastal Commission
CCNM	California Coastal National Monument
CCP	Comprehensive Conservation Plan
CCR	California Code of Regulations
CeNCOOS	Central and Northern California Ocean Observing System
CEQA	California Environmental Quality Act
CESA	California Endangered Species Act
CFIS	Commercial Fisheries Information System
CFIS	Commercial Fisheries Information System
CFR	Code of Federal Regulations
CH ₄	methane
CICORE	California State University Center for Integrative Coastal Observation, Research and Education
CNRA	California Natural Resources Agency
CO	carbon monoxide
CO ₂	carbon dioxide
CO ₂ e	carbon dioxide equivalent
Coastal Act	California Coastal Act of 1976

Acronyms (continued)

COLREGS	(commonly called 72 COLREGS) International Navigation Rules (Rules), formalized in the Convention on the International Regulations for Preventing Collisions at Sea (1972), and adopted by Congress as the International Rules Act of 1977
Commission	California Fish and Game Commission
CPFV	commercial passenger fishing vessel
CRFS	California Recreational Fisheries Survey
CRHR	California Register of Historical Resources
CWA	Clean Water Act
CZMA	Coastal Zone Management Act
DEIR	Draft Environmental Impact Report
Department	California Department of Fish and Game
DPS	Distinct Population Segment
DTSC	Department of Toxic Substances Control (under the California Environmental Protection Agency)
ECA	Enhanced Compliance Alternative
EEZ	Exclusive Economic Zone
EFH	Essential Fish Habitat
ENSO	El Niño-Southern Oscillation
EO	Executive Order
ESA	federal Endangered Species Act
ESI	Environmental Sensitivity Index
ESU	Evolutionary Significant Unit
FCC	Federal Communications Commission
FEIR	Final EIR
FERC	Federal Energy Regulatory Commission
FGC	California Fish and Game Code
FIFRA	Federal Insecticide, Fungicide, and Rodenticide Act
FLUPSY	floating upwelling racks
FMP	fishery management plan
ft	feet
g/kWh	grams per kilowatt-hour
GHG	greenhouse gas
GMP	General Management Plan
H.R.	U.S. House of Representatives
HAPC	habitat area of particular concern
HBGS	Humboldt Bay Generating Station
HBPP	Humboldt Bay Power Plant
HC	hydrocarbons
HOODS	Humboldt Open Ocean Dredged Site
HSU	Humboldt State University
HSWA	Hazardous and Solid Waste Amendments of 1984
Humboldt Bay District	Humboldt Bay Harbor, Recreation and Conservation District
HWCL	Hazardous Waste Control Law
IMO	International Maritime Organization
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
km	kilometer(s)
kW	kilowatt(s)

Acronyms (continued)

LCP	Local Coastal Program
LME	Large Marine Ecosystem
LOP	level of protection
LUP	land use plan
Magnuson–Stevens Act	Magnuson–Stevens Fishery Conservation and Management Act
MARINe	Multi-Agency Rocky Intertidal Network
MARPOL	International Convention for the Prevention of Pollution from Ships
MBTA	Migratory Bird Treaty Act
MCAQMD	Mendocino County Air Quality Management District
mi	statute mile(s)
mi ²	square statute mile(s)
MLPA Master Plan	<i>California Marine Life Protection Act Master Plan for Marine Protected Areas</i>
MLPA	Marine Life Protection Act
MLPAI	California Marine Life Protection Act Initiative
MMA	managed marine area
MMAIA	Marine Managed Areas Improvement Act
MMPA	Marine Mammal Protection Act
MMRP	mitigation monitoring and reporting program
MOU	Memorandum of Understanding
MPA	marine protected area
N ₂ O	nitrous oxide
NAAQS	National Ambient Air Quality Standards
NAHC	Native American Heritage Commission
NCAB	North Coast Air Basin
NCRSG	North Coast Regional Stakeholders Group
NCUAQMD	North Coast Unified Air Quality Management District
NEPA	National Environmental Protection Act
NFMP	Nearshore Fishery Management Plan
NGO	nongovernmental organization
NHPA	National Historic Preservation Act
NHTSA	National Highway Traffic Safety Administration
nm	nautical mile(s)
NOAA Fisheries	National Marine Fisheries Service
NOAA	National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration
NOP	Notice of Preparation
North Coast Unified AQMD	North Coast Unified Air Quality Management District
NO _x	nitrogen oxides
NPDES	National Pollutant Discharge Elimination System
NPS	National Parks Service
NRHP	National Register of Historic Places
NWIC	Northwest Information Center
Ocean Plan	California Ocean Plan
OEHHA	Office of Environmental Health and Hazard Assessment
OPA	Oil Pollution Act
OSPR	Oil Spill Prevention and Response Act
PEIR	programmatic environmental impact report
PFMC	Pacific Fishery Management Council

Acronyms (continued)

PG&E	Pacific Gas and Electric Company
PISCO	Partnership for Interdisciplinary Studies of Coastal Oceans
PM	particulate matter
PM ₁₀	respirable particulate matter
PM _{2.5}	fine particulate matter
Porter–Cologne Act	Porter–Cologne Water Quality Control Act
POTWs	publicly owned treatment works
PRC	California Public Resources Code
RCA	Rockfish Conservation Areas
RCRA	Resource Conservation and Recovery Act
Regional Profile	<i>Regional Profile of the North Coast Study Region: California/Oregon Border to Alder Creek</i>
Resources Agency	California Natural Resources Agency
RHA	River and Harbors Act of 1899
RMP	Resource Management Plan
RNA	regulated navigation area
RNCP	Revised North Coast Regional Stakeholder Group MPA Proposal
RNCP	Revised Round 3 NCRSG MPA Proposal
ROG	reactive organic gas
RSG	Regional Stakeholder Group
Rules	International Navigation Rules
RWQCB	Regional Water Quality Control Board
SAR	Search and Rescue
SAT	MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team
SAT	Science Advisory Team
SB	Senate Bill
SC	Special Closure
SFA	Sustainable Fisheries Act
SIG	Statewide Interests Group
SLC	California State Lands Commission
SMCA	state marine conservation area
SMCPA	state marine cultural preservation area
SMP	state marine park
SMR	state marine reserve
SMRMA	state marine recreational management area
SO ₂	sulfur dioxide
SOU	Special Operations Unit
SR	State Route
State Lands	California State Lands Commission
State Parks	California Department of Parks and Recreation
State Tidelands	State Tidelands and Submerged Lands
State	State of California (government)
Study Region	North Coast Study Region
study region	North Coast Study Region
SWQPA	state water quality protection area
SWRCB	State Water Resources Control Board
TAC	toxic air contaminant
TCP	Traditional Cultural Property

Acronyms (continued)

Thermal Plan	Water Quality Control Plan for Control of Temperature in Coastal Interstate Waters and Enclosed Bays and Estuaries of California
TMDL	total maximum daily load
TSS	Traffic Separation Scheme
UCSC	University of California, Santa Cruz
UNCLOS	United Nations Convention on Law of the Sea
USACE	U.S. Army Corps of Engineers
USC	U.S. Code
USCG	U.S. Coast Guard
USEPA	U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
USFWS	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
VTS	Vessel Traffic Services