

**Ecosystem Restoration Program
Monitoring and Evaluation Proposal Solicitation
Selection Panel Initial Recommendation**

The CALFED Bay-Delta Program Ecosystem Restoration Program (ERP) Selection Panel has met and considered highly-rated proposals received in response to its Monitoring and Evaluation Proposal Solicitation Package. The panel's initial recommendations are presented below.

The complete list of projects initially recommended for funding is posted on the CALFED Bay-Delta Program ERP PSP website at http://calwater.ca.gov/Solicitation/ERP_Solicitation.shtml. The Selection Panel's specific initial recommendations and the information the panelists considered to develop their recommendations, including the proposals, and the Technical Panel, Regional Panel, external scientific and administrative reviews of the proposals will also be posted on the website as soon as possible.

Public Comment Period:

Public comments on these initial recommendations will be accepted until 3 p.m., Friday, May 6, 2005. The Selection Panel will consider written comments from local governments and tribes on local feasibility concerns related to these applications. For example, a project that might not receive local permits or that would require General Plan or zoning amendments could face delays or other implementation barriers. The Selection Panel will consider clarifying comments from applicants, but will not consider new information about an applicant's proposal. We are not requesting letters of support or opposition.

Please address your comments on the initial recommendation to: Dan Ray, Grants Officer, California Bay-Delta Authority, Ecosystem Restoration Program, 650 Capitol Mall, 5th floor, Sacramento CA 95814. Written comments need to be mailed or faxed. Letter format is encouraged. No e-mails, please.

Explanation of Recommendation Categories:

The Selection Panel's recommendations fall in three categories.

- **Fund.** Proposals may be recommended for funding, in whole or in part. Conditions of approval may be included in recommendations for funding of some proposals to address issues raised during the proposals' reviews.
- **Reconsider if Revised.** These are proposals that are high priorities and should be considered for funding if they are revised to address shortcomings identified in their reviews. Revised proposals that are resubmitted for reconsideration will

undergo a new round of review to examine whether the shortcomings that the Selection Panel identified have been resolved satisfactorily.

- **Do Not Fund.** These proposals have serious technical deficiencies or are of lower priority to the ERP at this time. This category also includes proposals that were rated both inadequate by the Technical Panel and medium or lower by the applicable Regional Panel.

A Note on "Amount". For proposals recommended for funding, the amount shown is an upper limit recommended by the Selection Panel. For proposals recommended for reconsideration if revised, the amount provides general guidance on a target that the panel believes should be appropriate for the revised proposal's budget. In a few cases, the panel is providing only general guidance on the topics or tasks that should be included in a revised proposal, without suggesting an amount.

The panel recommends that ERP implementing agencies' staff seek greater budget detail, revised budgets, and use other mechanisms to reduce costs in all the proposals recommended for funding or reconsideration. Overhead and administrative rates, and fees paid for services and consultants, particularly private contractors, should receive particular attention.

Fish Monitoring. Several proposals sought funds for baseline monitoring of salmon populations status and trends or of water flows in the ERP's Sacramento Region. The Selection Panel and the PSP's Technical Panel concluded that this monitoring was not well suited to evaluating the outcome of ecosystem restoration actions, which was the focus of the proposal solicitation package. The panel nevertheless recognizes that this monitoring is of great utility in assessing status and trends of some priority salmon species populations in the upper Sacramento River basin and of waters on which they depend. The Selection Panel recognizes the value of these data for status and trends analyses, management activities such as setting take limits, and for ongoing modeling efforts. The Selection Panel suggests that these applicants seek funding for this essential monitoring through other, more appropriate sources or mechanisms.

Copies of the specific reviews of individual projects will be available on the PSP website at http://calwater.ca.gov/Solicitation/ERP_Solicitation.shtml.

Recommendations:

California Department of Fish and Game. *Merced River Restoration Project Monitoring, Crocker-Huffman Dam to Gallo Ranch.*

Amount sought: \$2,051,106

Duration: 36 months

This project is monitoring of geomorphic and revegetation development on the Robinson Reach of the Merced River Salmon Habitat Enhancement Project. Fisheries

monitoring will also evaluate salmonid production, survival and rearing habitat on the entire study reach, focusing on past restoration actions. The project is located in the Merced County and includes 17.0 miles of the Merced River from Crocker Huffman Dam (RM 52.0) to Gallo Apple Ranch (RM 35.0).

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

California Department of Fish and Game. *Juvenile anadromous salmonid emigration monitoring on the Sacramento River at the Glenn-Colusa Irrigation District (GCID) Fish Screen Bypass Channel*

Amount sought: \$90,072

Duration: 36 months

This project will continue an existing California Department of Fish and Game juvenile salmonid monitoring project located at the Glenn Colusa Irrigation District (GCID) diversion on the Sacramento River near Hamilton City.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

California Department of Water Resources. *Real-Time Flow Monitoring*

Amount sought: \$330,000

Duration: 36 months

This project is the continued operation and maintenance of flow monitoring stations on four eastside Sacramento River tributaries: Big Chico, Butte, Deer and Mill creeks.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

California Department of Water Resources. *The COYOTE Project: a Unified Approach to Monitoring Floodplain and Freshwater Tidal Marsh Restoration in the Cosumnes Preserve and Yolo Bypass*

Amount sought: \$5,107,577

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor connectivity and key ecological variables within the Yolo Bypass and the Cosumnes Preserve. The program will take advantage of comparisons between similar ecosystems in the Yolo Bypass and Cosumnes River to assess project performance and the impacts of seasonal and interannual hydrologic variability.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

Amount: **\$1,500,000**

California State Coastal Conservancy. *Near-field and Far-field Effects of Tidal Wetland Restoration in the Lower Napa River*

Amount Sought: \$2,731,376

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor the effects of the Napa Salt Marsh Restoration Project, and determine its effects on the Napa River Estuary.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

California State Coastal Conservancy. *Monitoring for Invasive Spartina Control in the San Francisco Estuary*

Amount sought: \$1,651,396

Duration: 36 months

The proposed project will monitor marsh areas treated to control Atlantic cordgrass and its hybrids to determine if treatment was effective. Annual regional surveys for nonnative cordgrasses in the San Francisco Estuary will also be included.

Recommendation: Fund

Amount: **\$1,234,396**

Conditions:

1. The Selection Panel agrees with the Technical Panel that the genetic marking work is not essential. Eliminate the QTL development task and continue to use the RAPD method for a cost savings of \$139,000 per year for 3 years - total \$417,000.
2. A detailed explanation of the proposed administrative overhead rates and an evaluation of the proposed administrative fees for the primary and subcontractor agreements are required. The panel recommends that State reserves the right to negotiate a reasonable administrative overhead rate and additional fee rates other than stated in the grant proposal.
3. The proposed grantee shall provide a description of qualifications and a short justification for contracting services for pre-selected subcontractors. The proposed

grantee shall submit a detailed budget identifying labor rates and indirect costs of the proposed subcontractors.

California State University, Chico. *Sacramento River Riparian Monitoring and Assessment Project*

Amount sought: \$3,222,967

Duration: 36 months

This project will measure a range of physical and biological indicators for ERP and AFRP-funded projects within the Sacramento River Ecological Management Zone between Red Bluff and Colusa and compare them to previous conditions and reference systems to test whether restoration actions have improved riparian forest conditions and forest interactions with aquatic processes.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

California State University, Chico. *Butte Creek spring-run Chinook salmon life history investigation*

Amount sought: \$513,281

Duration: 36 months

This project, a partnership between California State University, Chico Research Foundation and the California Department of Fish and Game, will continue the Butte Creek spring-run Chinook salmon (SRCS) life history investigation for an additional three years.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

Amount: **\$513,281**

California State University, Hayward. *Multidisciplinary monitoring of environmental processes in CALFED restored marshes in the Suisun Bay ecological zone. Phase Two: Importance of marsh tidal pools, algae, and other features along marsh channels.*

Amount sought: \$1,023,911

Duration: 36 months

This project would be Phase II of comparative monitoring of tidal marshes at four recent CALFED-supported marsh restorations and three reference marshes.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

California State University, Sacramento. *Effects of structural enhancement on salmonid spawning*

Amount sought: \$188,776

Duration: 24 months

This project will study the influence of structure on intergravel permeability, down-welling, sediment composition and behavior of spawning salmonids on Chinook salmon and steelhead spawning habitat in the Central Valley of California, including sites construction or monitored with CALFED or AFRP support.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

Fishery Foundation of California. *Cosumnes River Passage Improvement Monitoring Program*

Amount sought: \$251,647

Duration: 36 months

This project will continue to monitor a previously funded CALFED/Anadromous Fish Restoration Program (AFRP) project: the Cosumnes River Salmonid Barrier Improvement Project.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund.

Fishery Foundation of California. *Monitoring Study of Western Delta Aquatic Habitat Restoration Sites including Twitchell Island Restoration Site – K250/1997*

Amount sought: \$411,820

Duration: 36 months

This project will continue monitoring at two western Delta restorations sites and initiate monitoring at the Twitchell Island Set-Back Levee Restoration Site on the lower San Joaquin River. The objective of the proposed monitoring is to compare fish habitat use within and among the three sites and adjacent river reference areas of the Western Delta.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Friends of the Tuolumne, Incorporated. *Tuolumne River Post Construction Habitat Evaluation*

Amount sought: \$353,790

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor two separate restoration projects managed by Friends of the Tuolumne: Bobcat Flat Rivermile 43 and Grayson River Ranch.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Lassen National Forest. *Monitoring effectiveness of watershed improvement measures in Deer, Mill, Antelope and Battle Creeks.*

Amount sought: \$259,152

Duration: 36 months

This project would assess the effectiveness of past and ongoing watershed improvement activities in four of the five watersheds on the Lassen National Forest that support anadromous fishes: Deer, Mill, Antelope and Battle Creeks.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Marin Audubon Society. *Petaluma Marsh Expansion Project - monitoring and secondary test site for the integrated regional wetland monitoring project.*

Amount sought: \$235,000

Duration: 12 months

This project will monitor and evaluate the Petaluma Marsh Expansion Project.

Recommendation: Fund

Amount: **\$235,000**

Conditions:

Several concerns were raised by reviewers concerning the projects budget. Final approval of funding for this project should be conditioned on the applicants successfully providing detailed budget information addressing deficiencies identified in the budget review. According to the proposal, the California Department of Transportation provided

\$185,000 to complete regulatory compliance monitoring, but the applicants feel they need another \$50,000 to fully implement the previously funded monitoring plan. The funding agency should confirm with CalTrans that the \$50,000 requested in this proposal to implement the CalTrans funded monitoring plan is a reasonable investment of State funds. If the Science Program approves funding for a related proposal titled "Integrated Regional Wetland Monitoring (IRWM) Project", then final approval of funding for the Petaluma Marsh expansion monitoring project should also be conditioned on reconciling the budget for this effort with the budget for the related request before the Science Program, to ensure that funding is complementary and not duplicative.

National Audubon Society. *Monitoring ecosystem response and restoration implementation in western Sacramento Valley watersheds*

Amount sought: \$1,200,000
Duration: 36 months

This project will expand the monitoring efforts initiated during National Audubon Society's Willow Slough Rangeland Stewardship Program to monitor restoration actions carried out by Audubon-California (ERP-98-E13, ERP-01-N31), the Center for Land-Based Learning (ERP-02-P11), the Solano Land Trust's Jepson Prairie Preserve (ERP 97-N10, ERP-02-P21), and The Nature Conservancy's Lassen Foothills Project

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Pacific States Marine Fisheries Commission. *Upper Sacramento River Basin Chinook salmon escapement monitoring program*

Amount sought: \$1,353,357
Duration: 36 months

This proposal will continue monitoring of the annual abundance, migration timing, and distribution of adult winter, spring, late-fall and fall-run Chinook salmon returning to spawn in the Upper Sacramento River basin for the next three years. Streams and species/runs to be monitored include: Sacramento River - winter, fall, and late fall-run Chinook; Clear Creek - fall-run Chinook; Battle Creek - fall-run Chinook; Mill Creek -

fall and spring-run Chinook; Deer Creek - fall and spring-run Chinook; Beegum Creek - spring-run Chinook; Antelope Creek - spring-run Chinook.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Plumas Corporation. *Upper Last Chance Restoration Project Monitoring*

Amount sought: \$473,804

Duration: 36 months

This project will continue monitoring of a nine-mile gully elimination project in the Last Chance Creek watershed, a tributary to the Feather River, in Plumas County.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

River Partners. *Vegetation and wildlife response to native grass restoration on the Llano Seco Unit, Sacramento River National Wildlife Refuge*

Amount sought: \$372,100

Duration: 36 months

This project will examine the performance of a riparian savanna and grassland restoration on 206 acres of the Sacramento River National Wildlife Refuge's Llano Seco unit located approximately 10 miles southwest of Chico.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

River Partners. *Assessment of vegetative and wildlife responses to innovative restoration design on the Beehive Bend unit*

Amount sought: \$364,156

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor the restoration responses the Department of Fish and Game's "Sacramento River Floodplain Acquisition - Riparian Forest Restoration" project (ERP-97-N03B).

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

River Partners. *VELB Colonization of Planted Riparian Restoration Projects along the Middle Sacramento River*

Amount sought: \$638,851

Duration: 36 months

This project will survey Valley elderberry longhorn beetles on restored riparian habitats at eight selected units of the Sacramento River National Wildlife Refuge.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

River Partners. *Sub-surface water quality monitoring on restored riparian sites along the middle Sacramento River*

Amount sought: \$409,350

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor the sub-surface soil water under planted riparian restoration sites adjacent to the Sacramento River between Red Bluff and Chico.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

San Francisco Estuary Institute. *Implementation of a wetlands monitoring system suitable for assessing ecosystem response to restoration actions*

Amount sought: \$1,774,680

Duration: 36 months

This project would extend the California Wetlands Monitoring Venture (CWMV) to the ERP solution area, including conducting wetlands and riparian inventory updates in selected ERP watersheds, extending the Wetland Tracker information system to the solution area, and applying the California Rapid Assessment Method for Wetlands to ERP-supported wetland restoration projects.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

San Joaquin County Resource Conservation District. *Murphy Creek restoration monitoring project*

Amount sought: \$583,054

Duration: 36 months

This project will determine the extent to which restoration actions undertaken by the Murphy Creek Restoration Project, especially removal of Sparrowk Dam, have improved fishery habitat and salmonid populations.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Sonoma Ecology Center. *Does It Work? Measuring the success of salmonid habitat restoration at multiple scales*

Amount sought: \$810,324

Duration: 36 months

This project will quantify the contribution of CALFED-supported restoration activities to steelhead (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*) population recovery in the Sonoma Creek.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Sonoma Ecology Center. *Arundo donax eradication and coordination program: monitoring and evaluation*

Amount sought: \$396,352

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor sites where the Arundo Eradication and Coordination Program is attempting to eradicate giant reed to determine if their efforts are successful.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

Amount: **\$111,000**

Stockton East Water District. *Calaveras River: Bellota fish ladder passage evaluation*

Amount sought: \$144,051

Duration: 36 months

This is a proposal to monitor a fish ladder at the lower end of the Calaveras River's Bellota Weir to determine its effectiveness in providing fish passage.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

The Nature Conservancy. *Cosumnes River Preserve restoration monitoring data integration for adaptive management*

Amount sought: \$885,420

Duration: 36 months

This is a proposal to monitor past restoration actions on the lower Cosumnes River floodplain to forecast how future restoration actions will affect priority species and communities.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

The Nature Conservancy. *Measuring the Performance of Riparian Restoration Projects on the Sacramento River*

Amount sought: \$1,103,944

Duration: 36 months

This project will determine the success of riparian restoration projects on the upper Sacramento River.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

Tri-Dam Project. *Stanislaus River Chinook salmon and steelhead escapement evaluation*

Amount sought: \$551,914

Duration: 36 months

This project will measure Chinook salmon and steelhead escapement, primarily through carcass surveys, on the Stanislaus River.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Tri-Dam Project. *Assessment of project specific and cumulative effects of restoration on Stanislaus River juvenile Chinook production*

Amount sought: \$478,509

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor the outmigration of juvenile Chinook salmon to monitor the cumulative effects of in-channel restoration and other actions taken to restore and protect fall-run Chinook salmon on the Stanislaus River.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

Turlock Irrigation District. Tuolumne River Restoration Monitoring

Amount sought: \$2,430,400

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor the effectiveness of four restoration projects on the Tuolumne River.

Recommendation: Fund

Amount: **\$2,430,000**

Conditions:

Several concerns were identified in the budget review that must be met prior to a final grant award. The proposed grantee shall provide a description of qualifications and a short justification for subcontracting services for pre-selected subcontractors. The proposed grantee shall also submit a detailed budget identifying the labor rates and indirect costs of the proposed subcontractors. A detailed explanation of the proposed Administrative Overhead/Indirect costs rates and an evaluation of the proposed additional administrative fees for the primary and subcontractor agreements shall also be provided. The Selection Panel recommends that the State reserve the right to negotiate a reasonable administrative overhead rate and additional administrative fee rates other than stated in the grant proposal. In addition, the digital terrain model created for the project area must be available to the public.

US Fish and Wildlife Service. *Estimating the abundance of Sacramento River juvenile winter Chinook salmon with comparisons to adult escapement*

Amount sought: \$2,282,630

Duration: 36 months

The project is the operation of rotary-screw traps at Red Bluff Diversion Dam to obtain juvenile winter-run Chinook production indices and to correlate these indices with estimated escapement of these fish.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

US Fish and Wildlife Service *Monitoring and evaluation of riparian habitat and floodplain restoration at San Joaquin River National Wildlife Refuge*

Amount sought: \$1,464,782

Duration: 36 months

This project is a multidisciplinary monitoring and evaluation program on San Joaquin River floodplain lands protected and restored on and adjacent to the San Joaquin River National Wildlife Refuge.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

US Fish and Wildlife Service *Clear Creek anadromous salmonid monitoring program*

Amount sought: \$3,373,313

Duration: 36 months

This project is a comprehensive salmonid monitoring program that will evaluate restoration actions and inform adaptive management of Clear Creek.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

US Geological Survey. *Evaluation of the conservation value of lands purchased with CALFED funds for wintering Sandhill Cranes*

Amount sought: \$490,909

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitoring Greater Sandhill Cranes to evaluate how previous land acquisitions, easements and habitat enhancements in the San Joaquin–Sacramento Delta region can meet the needs of cranes wintering in the region.

Recommendation: Fund

Amount: **\$490,909**

Conditions:

A detailed explanation of the proposed Administrative Overhead/Indirect costs rates and an evaluation of the proposed additional administrative fees for the primary and subcontractor agreement is required. The Selection Panel recommends that the State reserve the right to negotiate a reasonable administrative overhead rate and additional administrative fee rates other than stated in the grant proposal. In addition the proposed grantee shall provide a short justification for pre-selected subcontractors/consultants (as cited on page 16 of the PSP).

The research team must clarify how this project will evaluate both public and private lands used by the birds.

US Geological Survey. *Comparison of hyporheic water quality and methylmercury exposure in salmonid redds within restored and unrestored gravels in the lower American River*

Amount sought: \$996,307

Duration: 36 months

This project will examine water quality in the gravels at the bottom of the river channel, and the potential for methylmercury exposure in salmonid redds at gravel restoration sites in the Lower American River.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

University of California, Davis. *Hypothesis-driven Monitoring of the CALFED/CVPIA Sponsored Gravel Augmentation on the Lower Mokelumne River*

Amount sought: \$705,052

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor gravel augmentation projects in the Lower Mokelumne River.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

University of California, Davis *Monitoring Sacramento perch populations in the Central Valley*

Amount sought: \$715,362

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor four established experimental Sacramento perch populations and three others to be established in 2005 in the Delta and Suisun Marsh, gathering data that can be used to optimize management of current and future restoration sites.

Recommendation: Do Not Fund

University of California, Davis. *Monitoring responses of the Delta Smelt population to multiple restoration actions in the San Francisco estuary*

Amount sought: \$2,658,648

Duration: 36 months

This project will monitor delta smelt to discern what environmental conditions, including access to restored habitats, result in high or low survival and population abundance.

Recommendation: Reconsider if Revised

Amount: **\$1,482,480**

Western Shasta Resource Conservation District. *Lower Clear Creek Monitoring Program*

Amount sought: \$1,308,449

Duration: 36 months

This project will include monitoring birds, geomorphology, riparian and wetland vegetation and the success of exotic species control efforts at the Lower Clear Creek Floodway Restoration Project.

Recommendation: Fund

Amount: **\$1,308,449**

Conditions:

The grant is subject to a detailed evaluation and approval of the whole budget to determine if labor rates and services are reasonable for services provided and are comparable to state or market rates.

For subcontractor portion of the budget, the proposed grantee shall provide a description of qualifications and a short justification for subcontracting services for pre-selected subcontractors (as cited on page 16 of PSP). The proposed grantee shall also submit a detailed budget identifying the labor rates and indirect costs of the proposed subcontractors.

* * *