

CALFED Bay-Delta 2002 ERP Directed Actions -- Selection Panel Review

Proposal Number: 13

Applicant Organization: California Department of Fish and Game

Proposal Title: Distribution and Relationship of Resident and Anadromous Central Valley Rainbow Trout.

Recommendation: Fund As Is

Amount: \$158,756.

Conditions, if any, of approval (if there are no conditions, please put "None"): None

Provide a brief explanation of your rating:

CDFG proposes to do otolith chemistry to answer these questions: where do resident and anadromous rainbow trout populations occur; do they overlap or not; and do resident rainbow trout (RT) contribute to the anadromous RT population and visa versa? The 2-year field study will sample 1,150 juvenile and adult. This project would be next-phase funding of a broader genetics evaluation ending next month. Results will be useful to understanding where steelhead occur with and without the resident form, and whether these two groups contribute to each other's population. The research will contribute new knowledge useful in addressing strategic goals of recovery of listed species and maintaining/enhancing harvestable species, and in understanding the ecology of steelhead in Central Valley streams, and in improved understanding of stocks to use in re-introductions. The technical review supports funding.

* * *

Research and Restoration External Review Form
CALFED Ecosystem Restoration Program 2002 Proposal Solicitation Package

IMPORTANT: Please read through the complete Reviewer's Guidelines inserted in the e-mail accompanying this form, including an explanation of the Conflict of Interest policy prior to reviewing any proposals. Complete this review form by entering information and your evaluation in the appropriate spot after each question.. Return the form as a word document to dray@water.ca.gov. Call Dan Ray at (916) 653-0198 with questions, please.

Proposal Title: Central Valley Steelhead Population Structure Evaluation

Review:

I reviewed an earlier draft of this proposal and made a number of suggestions for revisions. Many of these suggestions have been incorporated in the revised proposal. The revised proposal has expanded scope (as recommended), presents a review of literature substantiating the apparent feasibility of using SR/CA otolith microchemistry to assess interbreeding of resident and anadromous forms of *O. mykiss* (as recommended), proposes collection of juvenile fish in addition to adult fish (as recommended), and the proposal has a detailed listing of the streams and locations where samples are proposed to be collected (in marked contrast to a much more expensive but related proposal submitted by Demko/Cramer). At bottom of p. 14, the authors provide a very nice, brief summary of the constructive steps that they took to revise their proposal.

I am pleased with the constructive responses that the authors took to revision of their original proposal and I believe that the revised proposal is of relatively modest cost (by CALFED standards) and is worthy of CALFED funding. I feel reasonably certain that results from this study would be of substantial value for state and federal recovery actions for steelhead in the CV, and I believe that study results would be of substantial interest to fish ecologists interested in the dynamics of "systems" of resident and anadromous *O. mykiss*. We are only at the very beginning of understanding what I am certain will prove to be a very complex set of situations.

Miscellaneous comments:

Fund this project.