

**MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force and
California Fish and Game Commission
Summary of June 11, 2008 Joint Meeting
*Revised July 2, 2008***

**Clarion Hotel
700 – 16th Street
Sacramento, CA 95814**

Meeting Objectives

- *Receive presentation of Marine Life Protection Act (MLPA) North Central Coast Regional Stakeholder Group (NCCRSG) marine protected area (MPA) proposals submitted for the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region*
- *Receive the MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force recommendation for MPAs in the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region*
- *Receive summary of the methods used to evaluate MPA proposals*
- *Receive presentation of the MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team (SAT), California Department of Fish and Game (CDFG), and MLPA staff analyses and evaluations of the MPA proposals*

Meeting Attendance

MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force members: Chair Susan Golding, William Anderson, Don Benninghoven, Meg Caldwell and Catherine Reheis-Boyd

California Fish and Game Commission members: President Richard B. Rogers, Cindy Gustafson, Jim Kellogg, Daniel Richards and Michael Sutton

Meeting Summary

MLPA Blue Ribbon Task Force Chair Golding and California Fish and Game Commission President Rogers gave brief introductions. President Rogers explained that this was an informational meeting designed for the commission to receive the north central coast MPA proposals from the task force, and that more meetings would be held by the commission on the subject.

MLPA Initiative Executive Director Ken Wiseman provided an overview of the north central coast process, Dr. Scott McCreary (co-facilitator for the NCCRSG) summarized the accomplishments of the NCCRSG, Dr. Mary Gleason (principal planner for the MLPA Initiative) gave an update of the SAT, and Dr. Mary Gleason and Chair Golding gave an introduction and overview of the MLPA North Central Coast Integrated Preferred Alternative (IPA). Using the three MPA proposals developed by the NCCRSG, the task force developed the IPA and recommended it as the preferred alternative.

Evaluations of the IPA were then presented. Dr. Mark Carr (SAT member) presented habitat representation and replication, size and spacing, and birds and mammals evaluations. Dr. Mary Gleason presented an overview of the Goal 3 evaluation, and Dr. Astrid Scholz (SAT member) presented the maximum potential impact to both recreational and commercial fishermen for

proposals 1-3, 4, 2-XA and IPA. Dr. Eric Bjorkstedt (SAT member) presented a summary the results of the SAT modeling group and Susan Ashcraft (MPAs supervisor for CDFG) described the maximum potential impacts to the recreational abalone fishery. Sonke Mastrup (deputy director for CDFG) and Susan Ashcraft described the role of CDFG in providing advice on feasibility and the prospects of the proposals to meet the goals of the MLPA, and how these roles had changed from the MLPA Central Coast Study Region.

Public Comments

Wayne Owings (resident of San Francisco): Representative for 40 divers who signed a letter in support of the IPA. Stated that if changes are to be made they should include more protection.

Santi Roberts (Oceana, NCCRSG member): Thanked the task force and commission. Stated that he liked the special closures protection for seabirds and mammals.

Jerry Norton: Distributed a paper describing the economic impacts to Anchor Bay campground with MPAs. Described the campground's recent work to improve a creek on the property. Stated that they wanted to work with MPAs.

Paul Weaklund: Stated that we were not using our resources wisely. Stated that the science of MPAs and no-fishing zones were not proven.

Maria Brown (Gulf of the Farallones National Marine Sanctuary): Stated support for special closures in the sanctuary. Stated that even one disturbance event can have effects on birds. Committed to work with DFG to provide enforcement, outreach and education, and to get special closures on NOAA's nautical charts for the special closures within the sanctuary.

Rick Johnson (NCCRSG member): Supports the IPA. Stated support for the state marine park at Salt Point, and stated that, if conditions permit when the federal lease expires, Drakes Estero should be made into a state marine reserve. Requested that the modeling be validated.

Kevin Lenny: Stated support for the IPA. Expressed concern that mariculture and shellfish were overlooked in the process. Stated that shellfish provide ecosystem benefits.

Michael Greenburg (Alliance for Local Sustainable Agriculture): Stated support for the IPA. Stated concern that the other proposals contained language from the national marine sanctuary. Stated that the MLPA should not be involved in a federal matter.

Nancy Lenny (Drakes Bay Oyster Farm): Stated support for the IPA. Stated that the socioeconomic loss to oyster farms was never considered in the economic review. Presented a letter from a chamber of commerce. Stated that the lease at Drakes Bay represented 50% of the leased underwater land in California.

(President Rogers responded by stating that the MLPA does not mandate the inclusion of any formal evaluation of socioeconomics.)

Phillip Sanders (NCCRSG, California Abalone Association): Urged the commission not to go with the IPA due to the impacts in the northern portion of the study region. Stated concerns about communities that are already struggling in the north. Stated that the Point Arena harbor may have to shut down in response to the proposed closures.

Don McEnhill (Russian Riverkeeper): Urged the commission not to compromise with anything less than the IPA.

Angela Harren (Coastkeeper Alliance): Urged the commission to adopt the IPA with no alterations. Stated that this was an investment in the health of our coast for future generations.

Ann Maurice: Stated that this process was not science based and that sewage and pollution were overlooked. Stated that the modeling makes no sense because water quality is not included.

(Chair Golding stated that she agreed but that water quality is not a mandate of the MLPA.)

Zack Walton: Stated support for the IPA. Stated that the SAT evaluation does not include positive impacts oysters provide. Did not agree with President Rogers that socioeconomics is not in the MLPA as it is mentioned in one section of the act as well as in the master plan for MPAs.

Samantha Murray (NCCRSG): Stated that she had submitted a letter already. Ceded her time.

Karen Garrison (NCCRSG): Stated that she would like to see a stronger network but respects the compromise. Stated the importance and need for MPAs. Stated that careful attention was paid to the needs of fishermen.

Meeting Outcomes

The California Fish and Game Commission directed CDFG to prepare an initial statement of reason (ISOR) to serve as regulatory notice for the commission's August meeting and to include the IPA as the commission's "preferred alternative." CDFG was also directed to include the three NCCRSG proposals (1-3, 2-XA and 4) as regulatory alternatives. President Rogers committed to holding three public meetings on the proposed alternatives and indicated potential adoption in October 2008.