

**California MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Teams for the  
North Central Coast Study Region and the South Coast Study Region  
September 15, 2008 Joint Meeting Summary  
(revised October 31, 2008)**

**Monday, September 15, 2008  
9:30 a.m. - 5:30 p.m.**

**Embassy Suites Los Angeles – International Airport South  
1440 East Imperial Avenue  
El Segundo, CA 90245  
and via simultaneous webcast on the MLPA website**

*Note: Audio and video recordings of this meeting are available on the Internet at <http://www.dfg.ca.gov/mlpa/>. Please contact AGP Video Services at (805) 772-2715 to obtain DVD copies of these recordings.*

**North central coast SAT members attending:** Eric Bjorkstedt, Mark Carr, Chris Costello, Steve Gaines, Dominic Gregorio, Ray Hilborn, John Largier, Gerry McChesney, Steven Morgan, Pete Raimondi, and Astrid Scholz.

**North central coast SAT members absent:** Sarah Allen, Karina Nielsen, John Ugoretz, and Carl Walters.

**South coast SAT members attending:** Larry Allen, Richard Ambrose, Eric Bjorkstedt, Mark Carr, Susan Chivers, Chris Costello, Paul Dayton, Steve Gaines, Dominic Gregorio, Ray Hilborn, John Largier, Steven Morgan, Steve Murray, Dan Pondella, Pete Raimondi, Dan Robinette, Astrid Scholz, Stephen Stohs, Stephen Weisberg, and Steve Wertz.

**South coast SAT members absent:** None.

### **Meeting Objectives**

- *Welcome MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team (SAT) members for the MLPA South Coast Study Region*
- *Potentially adopt list of species likely to benefit for the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region (NCCSR)*
- *Potentially adopt the Methods Used to Evaluate MPA Proposals in the North Central Coast Study Region*
- *Potentially adopt SAT operating principles and select SAT chair(s)*
- *Discuss biogeography in the SCSR*
- *Receive report from modeling work group and discuss ideas for future study regions*
- *Discuss recommendations for considering water quality for marine protected area (MPA) planning*
- *Discuss initial south coast science questions and issues*
- *Identify SAT work groups to begin addressing science questions*
- *Discuss and potentially adopt criteria for handling external data and information*
- *Thank you and farewell to the SAT members for the NCCSR*

The meeting agenda may be found on the MLPA website at [http://www.dfg.ca.gov/mlpa/meetings\\_sc.asp](http://www.dfg.ca.gov/mlpa/meetings_sc.asp)

## **Executive Summary**

The eleventh meeting of the North Central Coast Study Region Science Advisory Team and the second meeting of the South Coast Study Region Science Advisory Team took place at the Embassy Suites in Los Angeles on September 15, 2008. Decisions made at this meeting:

- The north central coast SAT voted to adopt a final version of the list of species likely to benefit from marine protected areas (MPAs) in the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region. The SAT also voted to adopt the *Methods Used to Evaluate MPA Proposals in the North Central Coast Study Region*.
- Members of the south coast SAT formed work groups to draft answers to preliminary science questions and elected a chair and two co-chairs.

## **Meeting Summary**

### **1. Welcome, Introductions and Review of Agenda**

On September 15, 2008, the eleventh meeting of the MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team (SAT) for the North Central Coast Study Region and the second meeting of the MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team for the South Coast Study Region were jointly held in Los Angeles.

### **2. Updates**

There were no updates.

### **3. MLPA North Central Coast Study Region**

Members of the SAT for the North Central Coast Study Region reviewed information on wintering waterbirds and voted to adopt the north central coast list of species likely to benefit with three modifications: Greater scaup will be listed as “most likely to benefit,” lesser scaup will be listed as “likely to benefit,” and common goldeneye will be removed from the list. SAT members also voted to adopt the *Methods Used to Evaluate Marine Protected Area Proposals in the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region*.

### **4. MLPA South Coast Study Region**

#### **A. Orientation, discuss and potentially adopt SAT operating principles, and select SCSR SAT chair(s)**

SAT members discussed the operating principles presented at their first meeting, including thoughts about an alternative voting system to the “up or down” vote, such as a ten-point voting

system. Members voted to approve the SAT operating principles as they stood, and agreed that the procedure for dealing with *ex parte* communication will be discussed more at the next SAT meeting. Additionally, SAT members voiced concerns that at least one co-chair should be based in the MLPA South Coast Study Region, and that multiple co-chairs would help spread the responsibilities. At the end of the meeting, south coast SAT members nominated and approved Mark Carr as chair with Larry Allen and Steve Murray as co-chairs.

*B. Review and discuss MPA evaluation criteria and methods*

MLPA staff presented a summary of the MPA evaluation criteria and methods used in the north central coast, and asked south coast SAT members to consider how the methods might be used in the MLPA South Coast Study Region. SAT members discussed using a quantitative rather than qualitative metric for levels of protection, and a levels of protection work group was formed to consider these issues.

*C. Present and discuss preliminary evaluation of SCSR MPAs*

SAT member Mark Carr presented a preliminary evaluation of the existing MPAs in the MLPA South Coast Study Region. The presentation included size, spacing, and habitat evaluations, but not bird and mammal, modeling, or socioeconomic evaluations. Also, the south SAT has not yet established bioregions in the study region, and future evaluations will benefit from better-quality substrate and habitat maps. Additionally, the California Fish and Game Commission has asked the SAT to evaluate the existing northern Channel Islands MPAs and indicate the relationship between the islands and mainland MPAs. The evaluation presented at the SAT meeting is a first draft of the evaluation requested by the commission.

*D. Present and discuss biogeographic regions in the SCSR*

SAT member Pete Raimondi presented information on potential bioregions in the MLPA South Coast Study Region. Bioregions will be used during the MPA proposal evaluation process to ensure areas with unique species assemblages are adequately protected within the south coast MPAs. SAT members discussed where possible bioregions might be located, and a work group was formed to collect data on this topic.

*E. Present and discuss 'key and unique' habitats*

SAT member Mark Carr presented information on potential key and unique habitats in the MLPA South Coast Study Region. Other SAT members suggested additions to the list, such as oil seeps and gravel beds. A work group was formed to further discuss key and unique habitats.

*F. Review draft SCSR list of species likely to benefit from MPAs*

MLPA staff presented the draft list of species likely to benefit from MPAs in the south coast, as well as the criteria for including a species on the list. SAT members discussed potential additions to both the species list and the criteria for inclusion. A work group was formed to address the list of species likely to benefit and criteria for inclusion.

*G. Discuss SAT review/contributions to the SCSR regional profile*

MLPA staff presented an overview of the regional profile for the MLPA South Coast Study Region, and informed SAT members that their input on the document would be very welcome.

***Thank You and Farewell to the North Central Coast SAT Members***

California Department of Fish and Game Deputy Director Sonke Mastrup thanked the members of the MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team for the North Central Coast Study Region for their hard work and dedication to the MLPA process. SAT members received certificates commemorating their participation.

***Public Comments***

Numerous members of the public commented on a variety of issues. Comments included providing advice on where to place marine reserves, how to involve the public in the process, and information about current and historic fishing practices in the SCSR. Members of the public also provided information about which habitats they were most interested in protecting, and suggested sources of data for the SAT to consider during the process.

***5. NCCSR SAT Modeling Work Group***

SAT member Chris Costello presented “the model formerly known as EDOM,” and Dr. Loo Botsford presented the UC Davis model. Both models were used as parallel and supplementary evaluation methods in the north central coast, and modelers solicited input from the SAT about how to improve the models for use in the south coast. SAT members discussed incorporating larval dispersal and ocean currents specific to the south coast, adding southern California species, and evaluating ecosystem impacts and species interactions. Additionally, SAT member Astrid Scholz provided information about the development of Marxan/Marzone for the MLPA South Coast Study Region to gauge socioeconomic impacts. A new modeling work group was formed to focus on modeling issues in the south coast.

***6. NCCSR Water Quality Work Group***

SAT members Dominic Gregorio and John Largier presented an introduction to water quality issues in the MLPA South Coast Study Region and how they might be addressed in MPA planning. The SAT discussed potentially providing guidelines to the MLPA South Coast Regional Stakeholder Group for use while designing MPA proposals. A new water quality work group was formed to follow up on this subject.

***7. SCSR Science Questions***

SAT members were presented with a preliminary list of science questions for the MLPA South Coast Study Region, which was developed by MLPA Initiative staff and members of the north central coast SAT. Members reviewed the questions and formed work groups to create draft responses for approval at future SAT meetings.

## **8. Next Steps**

Work groups formed during the meeting will work towards addressing the pertinent issues. Larry Allen and Dan Robinette from the SAT Sub-Team to the MLPA South Coast Project will attend the October 6-7, 2008 meeting of the MLPA South Coast Regional Stakeholder Group in Los Angeles. Future meetings of the SAT will likely be November 12, 2008, December 17, 2008, and January 27, 2009.

### ***Attachments (received in advance of the meeting)***

1. Draft meeting summary for May 30, 2008 SAT meeting
2. Proposed amendments to draft list of species likely (*and most likely*) to benefit from MPAs in the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region
3. Methods used to evaluate MPA proposals in the north central coast
4. Draft biogeographic regions and maps
5. Draft summary of key and unique habitats
6. Draft list of species likely to benefit from MPAs in the MLPA South Coast Study Region
7. Draft table of contents for the regional profile of the MLPA South Coast Study Region
8. Draft agenda for the September 16, 2008 oceanographic workshop
9. *Recommendations for Considering Water Quality and Marine Protected Areas in the MLPA South Coast Study Region*

### ***Handouts (received at the meeting)***

- A. PowerPoint presentation: *Review MPA Evaluation Methods for the MLPA North Central Coast Study Region* (Evan Fox, MLPA Initiative)
- B. PowerPoint presentation: *Preliminary evaluation of existing south coast MPAs* (Mark Carr, MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team)
- C. *Draft Analysis of Bioregions in the MLPA South Coast Study Region* (revised September 12, 2008)
- D. PowerPoint presentation: *Overview of Equilibrium Delay Difference Optimization Model* (Chris Costello, MLPA Master Plan Science Advisory Team)
- E. PowerPoint presentation: *Overview of University of California, Davis model* (Will White, University of California, Davis)
- F. PowerPoint presentation: *Overview of water quality issues and MPA planning* (Dominic Gregorio, State Water Resources Control Board)
- G. Initial south coast science questions and background information gathered to date
- H. Criteria for external data and information (with submission form)